



Lao People's Democratic Republic



Ministry of Public Works and Transport
DEPARTMENT OF ROADS

**ROAD SECTOR GOVERNANCE AND MAINTENANCE
PROJECT (RSGMP)**

ADB Loan No. 3368-LAO

BID EVALUATION REPORT FINANCIAL BID

FOR

Contract Package No. CW-6 Att-LR 9001

Rehabilitation and Maintenance Works of LR 9001

**Junction NR 18B to Ban Chalernxai (54.00 km)
Attapeu Province**

**Revised
12 July 2018**

Contents

1.	INTRODUCTION	1-
1.1	General	
1.2	Submission of Bids	1
1.3	Technical Bid Opening and Technical Bid Evaluation	1
1.4	Extension of Period of Validity and Bid Security	2
1.5	Financial Bid Opening.....	3
1.6	Basic Data and Exchange Rates	3
1.7	Bid Evaluation Committee.....	4
2.	FINANCIAL BIDS RESULT AND EVALUATION OF THE BIDS.....	5
2.1	Prices Opened and Arithmetically Corrected	5
2.2	Selection of Bid for Detailed Evaluation	6
2.3	Cash Flow	6
2.4	Analysis of Prices.....	6
3.	COMPARISON OF BIDS AND DETERMINATION OF LOWEST EVALUATED BID	7
3.1	Lowest Evaluation Bid.....	7
3.2	Results of Extension of Bid Validity Date and Bid Security Validity Date	7
3.3	Examination of Unbalanced Prices for Lowest Bid	8
3.4	Reasonableness of Price of Lowest Evaluated Bid	8
4.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	8
APPENDICES		
Appendix 1.	RECORD OF FINANCIAL BID OPENING	
Appendix 2.	BASIC DATA SHEET	
Appendix 3.	TABLE 1: SUMMARY OF BID PRICES	
	ARITHMETIC CORRECTION AND CORRECTED BID PRICES	
Appendix 4.	TABLE 2: BID PRICE COMPARISON WITH PRICE ADJUSTMENT	
Appendix 5.	TABLE 3: PAYMENT SCHEDULE	
Appendix 6.	TABLE 4: PRICES FOR SECTIONS OF THE WORK AND AS PERCENTAGES OF THE TOTAL BID PRICES	

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 General

The Lao People's Democratic Republic (the "Borrower") has received financing from the Asian Development Bank (ADB) in the form of a loan toward the cost of Road Sector Governance and Maintenance Project (RSGMP). Part of this financing will be used for payments under the Contract CW-6 Att-LR 9001. MPWT is the Ministry of Public Works and Transport of the Borrower, and DoR is the Department of Roads of MPWT which is responsible for the implementation of the Project.

International Competitive Bidding (ICB) is used for the procurement procedures include Single Stage-Single, Two-Envelop (1S2E) and public opening of bids. If national firms wish to participate under this circumstance, they are allowed to do so.

The bidders submit simultaneously two sealed envelopes, one containing the technical proposal and the other the financial proposal. Initially, only the technical proposals are opened at the date and time advised in the bidding documents. The financial proposals remain sealed and are held in custody by the Executing Agency. The technical proposals are evaluated by the Executing Agency. No amendments or changes to the technical proposals are permitted. The objective of the exercise is to allow the Executing Agency to evaluate the technical proposals without reference to price. Bids of bidders who do not conform to the specified requirements are rejected, with the approval of the ADB, as deficient bids. Following ADB approval of the technical evaluation, and at a date and time advised by the Executing Agency, the price proposals are opened in public. The price proposals of the technically responsive bidders are evaluated and, following approval by the ADB, the award of contract is made to the lowest evaluated substantially responsive bidder.

The invitation for Bids was issued to all bidders on 20 November 2017. Also, Notice of the Invitation for Bids was published on 20, 21 and 22 November 2017 in one English newspaper and two local newspapers as well as posted at ADB website and MPWT website. The site visit and pre bid meeting were held on 29 November and 30 November 2017 respectively at the Project site and the Department of Public Works and Transport (DPWT) Attapeu Province conference room. Twelve (12) contractors attended the pre-bid meeting and eighteen (18) contractors purchased the bidding documents.

The minutes of the pre-bid meeting were prepared and sent to all the contractors who purchased the bidding documents. Four (4) addenda to the bidding documents in the Circular Letters were delivered to the all bidders as the result of pre-bid meeting.

1.2 Submission of Bids

The date and time for the submission of bids were not extended and the reception of bids by DOR/MPWT was closed at 2.00PM Vientiane time on 4 January 2018 as scheduled in the Invitation for Bids. Out of eighteen (18) bidders who purchased the bidding documents, eight (8) bidders submitted bids.

1.3 Technical Bid Opening and Technical Bid Evaluation

The Technical bids were opened as specified in the bidding documents at 2:00 pm on 4 January 2018 at the DOR meeting room of MPWT by the Procurement Committee in the presence of representatives of bidders. The bidders' names, the amount of bid prices, the presence or absence of bid security and its amount were announced and recorded. The Record of Bid Opening was prepared soon after the bids were announced, and a copy of the Record of Technical Bid Opening was forwarded to ADB for their information under cover of the letter No.00383/PWT. DoR dated 5 January 2018 signed by Director General, DoR, MPWT. Evaluation of the Technical Bid was made by the Procurement Committee (i.e. A Bid Evaluation Committee) and the Technical Bid Evaluation Report (TBER) was submitted to ADB on 13 March 2018. On 5 April 2018 ADB issued no objection to MPWT's recommendation to consider the following seven (7) bidders as substantially and technical responsive for proceeding with the Bid Opening of the Financial Envelope of these bidders:

No.	Bidder No.	Name of Bidder
1	1	Somxay Chalern Construction Road and Bridge Co. Ltd. (LAO)
2	2	China Jiangxi Corporation for International Economic and Technical Cooperation (PRC)
3	3	HANSOL-KBI JV (KOR, KOR)
4	4	Road No.8 Construction Enterprise (R8CE) (LAO) and Tay Truong Son Construction Sole Co.Ltd. (TSC) (VIE) Joint Venture
5	6	Nonghai Group Sole Co., Ltd. (LAO)
6	7	Civil Engineering Construction Joint-stock Company NO. 525 (VIE)
7	8	Anhui Shuiian Construction Group Co. Ltd. (PRC)

1.4 Extension of Period of Validity of Bid and Bid Security

1st Extension

As the period of validity of bid would expire on 4 May 2018 and based on ADB's advice, MPWT requested all 7 bidders who are substantially and technical responsive on 10 April 2018 in accordance with Clause 18 of the ITB to extend the period of validity of the bid until 3 July 2018. The bid security also be extended 28 days beyond the deadline of the extended validity period, until 31 July 2018.

The six (6) bidders except the Bidder No. 8 of the total seven (7) substantially and technical responsive bidders, have accepted the extension of period of the bid validity in writing before the day of financial bid opening as MPWT requested. The bidder No.8 informed MPWT on 25 April by their email that they don't extend the period of the bid validity.

Bidder No.	Name of Bidder	Bid validity extension up to 3 July 2018	Bid validity extension up to 3 July 2018 (ITB Clause 19.3 -The bid security shall be valid for 28 days beyond the original validity period of the bid, or beyond any period of extension.)	Remarks (indicate if responsive or non-responsive)
1	Somxay Chalm Road Construction and Bridge Co. Ltd. (LAO)	Extended bid validity date as indicated in the response (till 3 July 2018)	Extended bid security validity date as indicated in the response (till 31 July 2018)	Responsive
2	China Jiangxi Corporation for International Economic and Technical Cooperation (PRC)	Extended bid validity date as indicated in the response (till 3 July 2018)	Extended bid security validity date as indicated in the response (till 31 July 2018)	Responsive
3	HANSOL-KBI JV (KOR, KOR)	Extended bid validity date as indicated in the response (till 3 July 2018)	Extended bid security validity date as indicated in the response (till 31 July 2018)	Responsive
4	Road No.8 Construction Enterprise (R8CE) (LAO) and Tay Truong Son Construction Sole Co.Ltd. (TSC) (VIE) Joint Venture	Extended bid validity date as indicated in the response (till 3 July 2018)	Extended bid security validity date as indicated in the response (till 31 July 2018)	Responsive
6	Nonghai Group Sole Co., Ltd. (LAO)	Extended bid validity date as indicated in the response (till 3 July 2018)	Extended bid security validity date as indicated in the response (till 31 July 2018)	Responsive
7	Civil Engineering Construction Joint-stock Company NO. 525 (VIE)	Extended bid validity date as indicated in the response (till 3 July 2018)	Extended bid security validity date as indicated in the response (till 31 July 2018)	Responsive
8	Anhui Shuian Construction Group Co. Ltd. (PRC)	Not extended	Not extended	Non-responsive)

2nd Extension

The extended bid validity of 3 July 2018 has expired during the financial bid evaluation. MPWT-DOR's requested 22 and 27 June 2018 for the 2nd extension of bid validity and bid security validity up to 2 August 2018 and 30 August 2018, respectively.

1.5 Financial Bid Opening

The invitation to the above seven (7) bidders for financial opening was issued by MPWT on 23 April 2018, and the financial bids were opened at 1:30 pm on 27 April 2018 at the meeting room of DoR by the Procurement Committee in the presence of representatives of bidders. The bidders' names, the amount of bid prices, the presence or absence of bid security and its amount were announced and recorded. The above six (6) bidders except the Bidder No. 8 participated in the financial bid opening.

The Record of Financial Bid Opening was prepared soon after the bids were announced, and a copy of the Record of Bid Opening was forwarded to ADB for their information under cover of the letter No.8900 / PWT.DoR. A copy of the Record of Financial Bid Opening is attached as Appendix 1.

1.6 Basic Data and Exchange Rates

The exchange rates used for the evaluation if required were the selling rates of opening technical

proposal, 4 January 2018, published by Banque pour le Commerce Extérieur Lao (BCEL). Basic information pertaining to the bidding is summarized and attached as Appendix 2.

1.7 Bid Evaluation Committee

The Procurement Committee (i.e. A Bid Evaluation Committee) comprising nine (9) senior officers of DoR, DPWT of Attapeu Province, DoF (Department of Finance) and DoP (Department of Planning) of MPWT, Department of External Finance of Ministry of Finance (MOF), and Department of International Cooperation of Ministry of Planning and Investment (MPI) was established by the Minister of MPWT.

Assistance was provided by the staff of the Project Management Consultant (PMC).

The Bid Procurement Committee members were:

Committee	Name	Position	Organization
Chairman	Mr. Litta Khattiya	Deputy Director General	DoR, MPWT
Member	Mr. Bounpasert Sisouvanh	Deputy Head of Division	Dept. of External Finance, MOF
	Mr. Somexay Keomanivanh	Deputy Director	DPWT Attapeu
	Ms. Sengamphay Nasipasert	Deputy Head of Division	DoR, MPWT
	Mrs. Douangdeun Vilaysak	Technical Staff	DoF, MPWT
	Mr. Vilatha Soulalai	Technical Staff	Dept. of International Cooperation, MPI
	Mr. Toulaxay Phanthavong	Technical Staff	DoP, MPWT
	Mr. Soullignat Vixayxongdeth	Project Manager	DoR, MPWT
	Mr. Thongsouk Aphaiyalath	Deputy Project Manager	DPWT Attapeu

The Committee members' decisions were made on the basis of unanimous views and in case a unanimous decision could not be reached on certain issues, the issues were referred to the Chairman for decision. The committee was held on 14 and 22 May 2018

2. FINANCIAL BIDS RESULT AND EVALUATION OF THE BIDS

2.1 Prices Opened and Arithmetically Corrected

Financial Bids of the following seven (6) bidders were opened at 1:30 pm on 27 April 2018 at the meeting room of DoR by the Procurement Committee in the presence of representatives of the bidders [publicly](#). The Bidder No.8 did not accept the extension of period of the validity in writing, and therefore, the bid was unopened.

Each bid was checked for arithmetic errors in accordance with the provisions of the bidding documents and such errors were corrected. The arithmetic errors were mainly simple computing errors and the Provisional Sum amount that should be the same amount indicated in the Bid Documents.

These corrections, none of which were substantial, were tabulated and are shown in Appendix 3: Table 1 Summary of Bid Prices (Arithmetic Corrections and Corrected Bid Prices).

The ranking in order of the lowest bid price is as follows.

Bidder No.	Name of Bidder	As Opened after discounts	Arithmetically Corrected	Price Ranking	Variation (From the lowest)
1	Somxay Chalern Construction Road and Bridge Co. Ltd. (LAO)	5,406,999.00	5,406,999.00	4	61%
2	China Jiangxi Corporation for International Economic and Technical Cooperation (PRC)	6,506,639.11	6,497,839.11	6	93%
3	HANSOL-KBI JV (KOR, KOR)	4,820,524.39	4,816,344.39	3	43%
4	Road No.8 Construction Enterprise (R8CE) (LAO) and Tay Truong Son Construction Sole Co.Ltd. (TSC) (VIE) Joint Venture	4,010,948.47	4,010,948.47	2	19%
6	Nonghai Group Sole Co., Ltd. (LAO)	6,143,325.18	6,143,325.17	5	82%
7	Civil Engineering Construction Joint-stock Company NO. 525 (VIE)	3,367,277.00	3,367,276.99	1	-
8	Anhui Shuian Construction Group Co. Ltd. (PRC)	unopened (no extension of bid validity)	unopened (no extension of bid validity)	unopened (no extension of bid validity)	unopened (no extension of bid validity)

2.2 Selection of Bids for Detailed Evaluation

In order to reduce the volume of work involved in the detailed evaluation, it was decided to evaluate initially only the three (3) lowest bids. Other bids would be evaluated only if adjustments, if any, to be made to the three lowest bids would bring their adjusted price above the unadjusted price of any of the other bids. Accordingly, only bids Nos. 3, 4 and 7 were initially evaluated and, since the adjusted prices of all three bids were lower than the unadjusted price of any of the other bids, the following detailed evaluation of the higher bids was not necessary

2.3 Cash Flow

The payment schedule (cash flow) of Bidder No.3 and No. 4 is attached as Appendix 5. The bidder No.4 provided the cash flow over the performance based maintenance period, and the bidder No. 7 didn't provide the cash flow table. However, no further action was taken on this matter as the prospective successful bidder may be required to submit full details to substantiate prior to award the Contract to the next lowest evaluated bidder whose offer is substantially responsive and is determined by the Employer to be qualified to perform the Contract satisfactorily.

2.4 Analysis of Prices

As a guide to the examination of prices quoted in the bids, prices quoted for each Section of the Work were computed, as defined in the Bill of Quantities, as a percentage of the total bid price and compared with the percentages of each bid and also with the corresponding percentages of the Executing Agency's estimate. The comparison is shown in Appendix 6: Table 4.

The Committee was satisfied that the three (3) bidders who were substantially responsive to the bidding documents, had understood the requirements for the Work and the specifications governing materials and construction processes, and that they were prepared to carry out the Work as specified in the bidding documents. Despite the differences in pricing of the various

sections of the Work, the Committee did not find any instances of intentionally unbalancing the bill.

3. COMPRISON OF BIDS AND DETERMINATION OF LOWEST EVALUATED BID

3.1 Lowest Evaluation Bid

The corrected and adjusted prices for the three bids that were evaluated in detail are shown in Appendix 6: Table 4. As that comparison shows, the lowest evaluated substantially responsive bid is that submitted by Bidder No. 7 for a total evaluated bid price of 3,367,276.99 USD. The 2nd lowest bid was submitted by Bidder No.4 for a total evaluated bid price of 4,010,948.47 USD, and the 3rd lowest bid was submitted by Bidder No.3 for a total evaluated bid price of 4,816,344.39 USD.

3.2 Results of Extension of Bid Validity Date and Bid Security Validity Date

The bid security needs to be extended 28 days beyond the deadline of the extended validity period, until 31 July 2018 (1st extension: see paragraph 1.4). The Bidders No. 4 submitted the extended bid security on 3 May 2018, but the Bidder No.3 and No.7 informed on 18 May 2018 and 17 May 2018 respectively that they would not extend the Bid security that will be valid till 1 June 2018. Also the other bidders, except the Bidder No.4, did not respond to the EA's further equest for the 2nd extension of the date of bid validity and bid security as requested up to 2 August and 30 August 2018, respectively, (see paragraph 1.4 2nd extension) as summarized below.

Bidder No.	Name of Bidder	Bid validity extension up to 2 August 2018	Bid validity extension up to 2 August 2018 (ITB Clause 19.3 -The bid security shall be valid for 28 days beyond the original validity period of the bid, or beyond any period of extension.)	Remarks (indicate if responsive or non-responsive)
1	Somxay Chalern Construction Road and Bridge Co. Ltd. (LAO)	did not respond to EA by due date	did not respond to EA by due date	Non-responsive
2	China Jiangxi Corporation for International Economic and Technical Cooperation (PRC)	informed to EA that they do not extend the validity by due date	informed to EA that they do not extend the validity by due date	Non-responsive
3	HANSOL-KBI JV (KOR, KOR)	informed to EA that they do not extend the validity by due date	informed to EA that they do not extend the validity by due date	Non-responsive
4	Road No.8 Construction Enterprise (R8CE) (LAO) and Tay Truong Son Construction Sole Co.Ltd. (TSC) (VIE) Joint Venture	Extended bid validity date as indicated in the response (till August 2018)	Extended bid security validity date as indicated in the response (till 30 August 2018)	Responsive
6	Nonghai Group Sole Co., Ltd. (LAO)	informed to EA that they do not extend the validity by due date	informed to EA that they do not extend the validity by due date	Non-responsive
7	Civil Engineering Construction Joint-stock Company NO. 525 (VIE)	informed to EA that they do not extend the validity by due date	informed to EA that they do not extend the validity by due date	Non-responsive

3.3 Examination of Unbalanced Prices for Lowest Evaluated Bid

Comparison of unit rates and prices, particularly early work items, of the lowest evaluated bid with average rates of the other two lowest bids and the Executing Agency's estimate were carried out.

3.3.1 High Unit Rates and Prices.

A unit rate or price is considered high if it is 50% higher than the average of two bids and/or the Executing Agency's estimate. There are high prices for Roadway Excavation (Bill 203) in the lowest Bid (Bidder No.7), however, total bid price of the earth works is lower than the two bids and/or the Executing Agency's estimate. There are no high prices in the 2nd lowest Bid (Bidder No.4).

From the above results of the review, the 1st lowest and 2nd lowest bids should not be considered as an unbalanced bid in respect of these works.

(a) High Unit Rates and Prices in Early Work Items (Bill 200-600).

Those work items which were to be carried out in the first eighteen (24) months for the Rehabilitation works are considered as early work items. There are high prices for Roadway Excavation (Bill 203) in the lowest Bid (Bidder No.7), however, total bid price of the earth works is lower than the two bids and/or the Executing Agency's estimate. There are no high prices in the 2nd lowest Bid (Bidder No.4).

(b) High Unit Rates and Prices for Other Items

The corresponding work quantities stated in the Bill of Materials of key items were checked and found to be calculated correctly. Detailed checking showed that the items involved are minor work items and the quantities of these items were unlikely to be increased significantly thus the 1st and 2nd lowest bids should also be considered as a balanced bid.

3.4 Reasonableness of Price of Lowest Evaluated Bid

A unit rate or price is considered low if it is 50% lower than the average of two bids and/or the Executing Agency's estimate. The lowest evaluated bid, submitted by Bidder No. 7, is about 40% lower and Bidder No.4 is about 29% than the Executing Agency's estimate. The unit prices of the Performance Based Maintenance Works (Bill BP100) proposed by both of Bidder No.7 and No.4 were rather low compared with the Executing Agency's estimate and other works of a similar nature in the country, however, it was considered that the bid of the lowest evaluated bidder is not substantially low because the road is just rehabilitated by the Project before the performance based maintenance starts.

There are low prices in the lowest Bid (Bidder No.7) for the Pavement, the prime coat (Bill 302) and rigid pavement / concrete pavement (Bill 314), however, total bid price of the Pavement (Bill 300) is 17 % lower than the 3rd lowest bidder No.3. There are no low prices in the 2nd lowest Bid (Bidder No.4).

The Committee was confident that the lowest evaluated bidder would be able to complete the Work in accordance with the specifications and the construction schedule with the bid prices.

4. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

On the basis of the systematic evaluation of financial bids as presented in this report that was endorsed by the Bid Evaluation Committee on 22 May 2018 and the results of [the 2nd extension of bid validity and bid security validity up to 2 August and 30 August 2018, respectively, it was recommended that award of contract](#) is made to the 2nd lowest price evaluated substantially responsive bidder because the 1st lowest bidder could not provide the required bid security that should be valid during succeeding procurement period.

Therefore, it was recommended that the Contract for CW-6 Att-LR9001 be awarded to Bidder No. 4 for the contract amount of 4,010,948.47 USD.

In that event of the failure the Employer may award the Contract to the next price lowest evaluated bidder whose offer is substantially responsive and is determined by the Employer to be qualified to perform the Contract satisfactorily.







APPENDIXES

APPENDIX 1

RECORD OF FINANCIAL BID OPENING

LOAN NO.: 3368-LAO PROJECT TITLE: Road Sector Governance and Maintenance Project (RSGMP)
 BID NO.: CW-6 At-LR 9001 (ICB, 1S2E) BID/ CONTRACT TITLE: Rehabilitation and Maintenance Works of LR 9001 in Attapeu Province

- The envelopes containing the Financial Bids of the following Bidders who have submitted substantially responsive Technical Bids and who have been determined as being qualified for award, which were kept in custody of the Employer, were publicly opened and read on 27 April 2018 at 1:30 p.m. Prior to the opening of the envelopes, the Bid Opening Committee, as well as the representatives of the concerned bidders, checked the condition of each envelope.

Bidder No.	Name of Bidder & Address <i>(insert full company name and full address)</i>	Bid Security Amount (USD)	Bid Amount (USD)	Discounts Offered <i>(Any discounts offered shall be recorded. Any alternative bids shall be opened.)</i>	Remarks (if any)	Signature of Bidders Representatives
1	SomxayChalern Construction Road and Bridge Co. Ltd. (LAO)	113,300.00	5,406,999.00	0		
2	China Jiangxi Corporation for International Economic and Technical Cooperation (PRC)	113,300.00	6,506,639.11	0		
3	HANSOL-KBI JV (KOR, KOR)	113,300.00	4,820,524.39	0		
4	Road No.8 Construction Enterprise (R8CE) (LAO) and Tay Truong Son Construction Sole Co.Ltd. (TSC) (VIE) Joint Venture	113,300.00	4,010,948.47	719,301.89		
6	Nonghai Group Sole Co., Ltd. (LAO)	113,300.00	6,143,325.18	0		
7	Civil Engineering Construction Joint-stock Company NO. 525 (VIE)	113,300.00	3,367,277.00	0		
8	Anhui Shuian Construction Group Co. Ltd. (PRC)					

2. The following bidders' representatives attended the public opening of financial bids and a copy of the attendance sheet is attached as an annexure of this record.

No.	Name	Designation	Bidding Company Represented
1	See Attached Sheet ATTENDANCE SHEET FOR OPENING OF FINANCIAL BIDS (Appendix 3 Page 3 and 4 of 4)		
2	Ditto		
3	Ditto		
4	Ditto		
5	Ditto		
6	Ditto		
7	Ditto		

3. Matters transpiring during the opening of bids:
 (Note: If any problem has been observed during opening, this must be stated here, also, if bidders request clarifications.

4. Reading and signing of bids ended at hours.

Signature
 Chairman of Procurement Committee
 Litta Khattiya
 Deputy Director General
 Department of Roads
 Ministry of Public Works and Transport





Signature
 Member of Procurement Committee
 Soukxay Xangkhath





Signature
 Member of Procurement Committee
 Somxay Keomanyamh

ATTENDANCE SHEET FOR OPENING OF FINANCIAL BIDS

LOAN NO.: 3368-LAO PROJECT TITLE: Road Sector Governance and Maintenance Project (RSGMP)
 BID NO.: CW-6 Att-LR 9001 (ICB, 1SZE) BID/ CONTRACT TITLE: Rehabilitation and Maintenance Works of LR 9001 in Attapeu Province
 Place: DOR Meeting Room, 2nd Floor of the front building, Ministry of Public Works and Transport, Lane Xang Avenue, Vientiane, Lao PDR
 Date and Time: 27 April 2018 at 1:30 p.m.

The following bidders' representatives attended the public opening of price bids.

Bidder No.	Name of Bidding Company	Name of Representative	Designation	Signature
1	Somxay Chalem Construction Road and Bridge Co. Ltd. (LAO)	Somnuek Louthavong	Deputy Director	
2	China Jiangxi Corporation for International Economic and Technical Cooperation (PRC)	Cheng Liang	Manager Director manage project translation	
		LAO XAO cheng	0 29 992	
3	HANSOL-KBI JV (KOR, KOR)	Jonachan (OTM)	Representative in Laos	

4	Road No.8 Construction Enterprise (R8CE) (LAO) and Tay Truong Son Construction Sole Co.Ltd. (TSC) (VIE) Joint Venture	MR PHAN DINH THAI	TSC Director	
		Ms. Sy Savanh Savanlasy	R8CE Engineer	
6	Nonghai Group Sole Co., Ltd. (LAO)	Mr Somesavanh	Staff Engineer SOM	
7	Civil Engineering Construction Joint-stock Company NO. 525 (VIE)	HO HAI LONG	Staff Engineer HHL	
8	Anhui Shuian Construction Group Co. Ltd. (PRC)			

APPENDIX 2

BASIC DATA SHEET

1.	Project Title:	Road Sector Governance and Maintenance Project
2.	Loan Number:	3368-LAO
3.	Bid or Contract Title:	Rehabilitation and Maintenance Works of LR 9001 in Attapeu Province (54 km)
4.	Bid or Contract Number:	CW-6 Att-LR 9001 (ICB)
5.	Estimated Value/ Engineer's Estimate:	5,664,023 USD
6.	Date Invitation for Bids Issued:	20 November 2017
7.	Method of Procurement:	ICB (1S2E)
8.	Bid Closing Date and Time:	04 January 2018, 14:00 hrs
9.	Number of Bids Received:8.....
10.	Technical Bid Opening Date and Time:	04 January 2018, 14:00 hrs
11.	Number of substantially responsive Technical Bids and been determined as being qualified for award7.....
12.	Price Bid Opening Date and Time:	27 April 2018, 13:30 hrs.
13.	Bid Validity Expires on:	04 May 2018 (120 days after bid submission deadline) 1 st extension till 03 July 2018 2 nd extension till 02 August 2018
14.	Bid Security Amount:	113,300 USD (approximately 2% of Engineers Estimate)
15.	Bid Security Validity Expires on:	01 June 2018 (28 days beyond bid validity) 1 st extension till 31 July 2018 2 nd extension till 30 August 2018
16.	Date for Determining Applicable Exchange Rates:	07 December 2017 (28 days prior to deadline for submission of bids)
15.	Exchange Rates for Evaluation:	1 USD = 8,311 LAK Selling rates of <i>opening technical proposal: 4 January 2018</i> published by the Banque pour le Commerce Extérieur Lao (BCEL)

APPENDIX 3

Appendix 3

TABLE 1: SUMMARY OF BID PRICES

(ARITHEMTIC CORRECTIONS AND CORRECTED BID PRICES)

Bidder No.	Bid Price at Opening		Discounts		After Discount		Arithmetic Correction Foreign Currency	Corrected Bid Price		Total Corrected Bid Price In (USD)	Ranking
	Foreign Currency (USD)	Local Currency	Foreign Currency (USD)	Local Currency	Foreign Currency (USD)	Local Currency		Foreign Currency (USD)	Local Currency		
	(1)	(1)	(2)	(2)	(3)	(3)	(4)	(5)	-		
1	5,406,999.00	-	0	-	5,406,999.00	-	0	5,406,999.00	-	5,406,999.00	4
2	6,506,639.11	-	0	-	6,506,639.11	-	-8,800.00	6,497,839.11	-	6,497,839.11	6
3	4,820,524.39	-	0	-	4,820,524.39	-	-4,180.00	4,816,344.39	-	4,816,344.39	3
4	4,730,250.35	-	-719,301.89	-	4,010,948.47	-	0	4,010,948.47	-	4,010,948.47	2
6	6,143,325.18	-	0	-	6,143,325.18	-	-0.01	6,143,325.17	-	6,143,325.17	5
7	3,367,277.00	-	0	-	3,367,277.00	-	-0.01	3,367,276.99	-	3,367,276.99	1

1 Based on the selling Exchange Rate: NA

APPENDIX 4

TABLE 2: BID PRICE COMPARISON

Sr. No.	Particulars	Bidder No. 3		Bidder No. 4		Bidder No. 7	
		Foreign (US\$)	Local (LC)	Foreign (US\$)	Local (LC)	Foreign (US\$)	Local (LC)
1	Bid Price (As Submitted) Including Discount	4,820,524.39	-	4,730,250.35	-	3,367,277.00	-
2	Bid Price (As Corrected)	4,816,344.39	-	4,010,948.47	-	3,367,276.99	-
3	Amount to be Adjusted For Deviations (a) Commercial (b) Technical	-	-	-	-	-	-
4	Sub-Total (2) to (3)	4,816,344.39	-	4,010,948.47	-	3,367,276.99	-
5	Converted to LC for Comparison	-	-	-	-	-	-
6	Ranking	(3)		(2)		(1)	

1 Based on selling exchange rate N-A

APPENDIX 5

TABLE 3: PAYMENT SCHEDULE

Contract No.: CW-6 Att-LR 9001

Period in Months	Monthly work progress (%)	Cumulated work progress (%)	Bidder No. 3		Monthly work progress (%)	Cumulated work progress (%)	Bidder No. 4		Bidder No. 7	
			Currency (US\$)	Amount Cumulation (US\$)			Currency (US\$)	Amount Cumulation (US\$)	Currency (US\$)	Amount Cumulation (US\$)
Start Date										
1st month					0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00		
2nd months	0.30	0.30	14,449.03	14,449.03	1.52	1.52	60,966.42	60,966.42		
3th months					2.42	3.94	97,064.95	158,031.37		
4th months	2.90	3.20	139,673.99	154,123.02	3.60	7.54	144,394.14	302,425.51		
5th months					3.80	11.34	152,416.04	454,841.56		
6th months	2.60	5.80	125,224.95	279,347.97	1.86	13.20	74,603.64	529,445.20		
7th months					1.75	14.95	70,191.60	599,636.80		
8th months	2.30	8.10	110,775.92	390,123.90	1.69	16.64	67,785.03	667,421.83		
9th months					3.94	20.58	158,031.37	825,453.20		
10th months	14.30	22.40	688,737.25	1,078,861.14	4.25	24.83	170,465.31	995,918.51		
11th months					3.86	28.69	154,822.61	1,150,741.12		
12th months	21.80	44.20	1,049,963.08	2,128,824.22	3.64	32.33	145,998.52	1,296,739.64		
13th months					3.63	35.96	145,597.43	1,442,337.07		
14th months	22.70	66.90	1,093,310.18	3,222,134.40	3.79	39.75	152,014.95	1,594,352.02		
15th months					3.64	43.39	145,998.52	1,740,350.54		
16th months	22.40	89.30	1,078,861.14	4,300,995.54	4.09	47.48	164,047.79	1,904,398.33		
17th months					3.34	50.82	133,965.68	2,038,364.01		
18th months	9.40	98.70	452,736.37	4,753,731.91	3.57	54.39	143,190.86	2,181,554.87		
19th months					3.64	58.03	145,998.52	2,327,553.40		
20th months	0.00	98.70	0.00	4,753,731.91	2.43	60.46	97,466.05	2,425,019.44		
21st months					2.12	62.58	85,032.11	2,510,051.55		
22nd months	0.00	98.70	0.00	4,753,731.91	2.43	65.01	97,466.05	2,607,517.60		
23rd months					3.03	68.04	121,531.74	2,729,049.34		
24th months	0.00	98.70	0.00	4,753,731.91	3.63	71.67	145,597.43	2,874,646.77		
25th months					3.34	75.01	133,965.68	3,008,612.45		
26th months	0.10	98.80	4,816.34	4,758,548.26	3.64	78.65	145,998.52	3,154,610.97		
27th months					2.73	81.38	109,498.89	3,264,109.86		
28th months	0.20	99.00	9,632.69	4,768,180.95	0.81	82.19	32,488.68	3,296,598.55		
29th months					0.80	82.99	32,087.59	3,328,686.14		
30th months	0.10	99.10	4,816.34	4,772,997.29	0.81	83.80	32,488.68	3,361,174.82		
31st months					0.81	84.61	32,488.68	3,393,663.50		
32nd months	0.20	99.30	9,632.69	4,782,629.98	0.81	85.42	32,488.68	3,426,152.18		
33rd months					0.81	86.23	32,488.68	3,458,640.87		
34th months	0.20	99.50	9,632.69	4,792,262.67	0.81	87.04	32,488.68	3,491,129.55		
35th months					0.81	87.85	32,488.68	3,523,618.23		
36th months	0.20	99.70	9,632.69	4,801,895.36	0.81	88.66	32,488.68	3,556,106.91		
37th months					0.81	89.47	32,488.68	3,588,595.60		
38th months	0.10	99.80	4,816.34	4,806,711.70	0.81	90.28	32,488.68	3,621,084.28		
39th months					0.81	91.09	32,488.68	3,653,572.96		
40th months	0.20	100.00	9,632.69	4,816,344.39	0.81	91.90	32,488.68	3,686,061.64		
41st months					0.81	92.71	32,488.68	3,718,550.33		
42nd months					0.81	93.52	32,488.68	3,751,039.01		
43rd months					0.81	94.33	32,488.68	3,783,527.69		
44th months					0.81	95.14	32,488.68	3,816,016.37		
45th months					0.81	95.95	32,488.68	3,848,505.06		
46th months					0.81	96.76	32,488.68	3,880,993.74		
47th months					0.81	97.57	32,488.68	3,913,482.42		
48th months					1.31	98.88	52,543.42	3,966,025.85		
49th months					0.22	99.10	8,824.09	3,974,849.93		
50th months					0.90	100.00	36,098.54	4,010,948.47		
Total				4,816,344.39				4,010,948.47		

NOT PROVIDED

Note: The amount is computed as "total bid prices (after arithmetic correction) multiply by work progress (%) provided by Bidders"

APPENDIX 6

TABLE 4: PRICE FOR SELECTIONS OF THE WORK AS PERCENTAGES OF THE TOTAL BID PRICES (US\$)

Section No.	Description	Executing Agency's Estimate		Bidder No. 03		Bidder No. 04		Bidder No. 07	
		Value	% of Total Estimate	Value	% of Bid Price	Value	% of Bid Price	Value	% of Bid Price
I	GENERAL ITEMS								
1	GENERAL PROVISION	247,200.00	4.80	347,432.72	7.93	144,800.00	3.61	143,680.00	4.69
	Sub-Total for General Provision:	247,200.00		347,432.72		144,800.00		143,680.00	
II	REHABILITATION WORKS								
1	LARGE SCALE REHABILITATION WORKS								
Bill 200	EARTH WORKS								
201	Clearing and Grabbing/Tree Removal	12,412.21	0.24	21,168.00	0.48	6,804.00	0.170	10,243.80	0.33
202	Demolition Works	732.00	0.01	2,349.30	0.05	250.00	0.01	663.74	0.02
203	Roadway Excavation	58,882.97	1.14	81,698.95	1.87	77,982.75	1.94	128,754.80	4.21
204	Construction of Embankment	76,151.80	1.48	143,359.47	3.27	44,673.96	1.11	60,602.79	1.98
207	Structure Excavation	1,394.13	0.03	1,260.00	0.03	2,651.25	0.07	1,617.38	0.05
209	Reconditioning of Existing Pavement for Overlay	117,234.86	22.77	56,980.00	13.01	62,160.00	1.55	33,152.00	10.83
	Sub-Total for Bill 200:	266,807.97		306,815.72		194,521.96		235,034.51	
Bill 300	PAVEMENT								
301	Aggregate Sub-Base	364,594.56	7.08	246,180.00	5.62	321,860.00	8.02	443,630.00	14.49
302	Crushed Aggregate Base Course	860,805.40	16.72	743,222.00	16.97	811,172.00	20.22	650,477.80	21.25
303	Prime Coat	445,429.57	8.65	297,479.10	6.79	350,820.18	8.75	193,053.68	6.31
304	Surface Dressing and Bituminous Seal Coat	1,440,031.87	27.97	647,591.64	14.79	1,150,582.98	28.69	624,882.08	20.41
313	Sand Layer under Concrete Pavement	30,420.00	0.59	40,284.00	0.92	39,510.00	0.99	31,739.40	1.04
314	Rigid Pavement/Concrete Pavement	465,600.80	9.04	640,446.44	14.63	498,639.92	12.43	227,784.56	7.44
	Sub-Total for Bill 300:	3,606,882.20		2,615,203.18		3,172,585.08		2,171,567.52	
Bill 400	DRAINAGE SYSTEMS								
401	Box Culverts	17,490.13	0.34	20,610.98	0.47	20,822.84	0.52	13,505.28	0.44
402	Pipe Culverts	20,842.44	0.40	30,103.24	0.69	27,439.19	0.68	15,409.04	0.50
404	Ditch, Apron Protection and Inlet and Outlet Structure	394,199.35	7.66	279,963.85	6.39	489,450.14	12.20	211,169.84	6.90
	Sub-Total for Bill 400:	432,531.92		330,678.07		537,712.16		240,084.16	
Bill 600	OTHER WORKS								
603	Guardrails	12,000.00	0.21	8,391.00	0.17	13,719.00	0.34	2,925.00	0.09
604	Traffic Marking	3,051.00	0.06	1,846.50	0.04	3,841.50	0.10	2,074.95	0.07
605	Traffic Signs	25,860.00	0.50	169,108.68	3.86	53,369.40	1.33	12,876.00	0.42
606	Kilometer and Edge Marker (Guide) Posts	20,875.00	0.41	17,030.81	0.39	20,372.49	0.51	7,166.00	0.23
	Sub-Total for Bill 600:	61,786.00		196,376.99		91,302.39		25,041.95	
	Summary Bill 200 - 600:	4,368,008.09		3,449,073.96		3,996,121.59		2,671,728.13	
2	SMALL SCALE REHABILITATION WORKS								
2.1	Reparing Works	5,132.84	0.10	10,965.30	0.25	5,756.00	0.14	7,818.35	0.26
2.2	Drainage and Erosion Protection Works	141.54	0.00	1,678.13	0.04	381.00	0.01	75.00	0.00
2.3	Traffic Safety	40,016.85	0.78	35,793.64	0.82	17,617.00	0.44	16,944.50	0.55
2.4	Rehabilitation and Improvement, Rehabilitation of Paved Road	100.33	0.02	167.80	0.04	300.00	0.01	263.60	0.01
	Sub-Total for Small Scal Rehabilitation Works	45,391.56		48,604.87		24,054.00		25,101.45	
III	PERFORMANCE BASED MAINTENANCE								
Bill BP 100	Performance Based Maintenance Work	460,449.00	8.94	411,704.32	9.40	78,310.00	1.95	172,800.00	5.64
	Sub-Total for Performance Based Maintenance Works	460,449.00		411,704.32		78,310.00		172,800.00	
IV	EMERGENCY WORKS (Provisional Quantities)	28,063.60	0.55	54,280.45	1.24	29,797.00	0.74	17,796.32	0.58
	Sub-Total for Emergency Works (Pro. Qty):	28,063.60		54,280.45		29,797.00		17,796.32	
V	DAYWORKS	0		67,398.58	1.54	27,145.00	0.68	30,055.00	0.98
	Sub-Total for Dayworks:	0		67,398.58		27,145.00		30,055.00	
VI	SUMMARY OF SPECIFIED PROVISIONAL SUMS	32,000.00	0.56	32,000.00	0.66	32,000.00	0.80	32,000.00	0.95
	Sub-Total for Provisional Sums:	included general item		32,000.00		32,000.00		32,000.00	
Total:		5,149,112.25	90.91	4,378,494.90	90.91	4,300,227.59	90.91	3,061,160.90	90.91
Contingency 10%		514,911.22	9.09	437,849.49	9.09	430,022.76	9.09	306,116.09	9.09
Contractor's Adjustment						-719,301.89			
Total: (Sub-Total + Contingency 10%)		5,664,023.47	100.00	4,816,344.39	100.00	4,010,948.47	100.00	3,367,276.99	100.00
Engineer Estimate Comparison				Lower than EA's Estimate - 14.97 %		Lower than EA's Estimate - 29.19 %		Lower than EA's Estimate - 40.55 %	

